Policy to Practice: Evidence-based process for building organization resilience

Resident work hours

Rajata Rajatanavin, MD, FRCP, FACP, FACE
International Workshop on Healthcare Professional Training
National Academy of Medicine
Washington, DC
27 April 2018

Thailand profile

- Population 67.7 million
- GNI per capita (2014) US$ 5,780
- Total Health Expenditure (2013) US$ 247 per capita, 4.5% GDP
### Healthcare Schemes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scheme</th>
<th><strong>Civil Servant Medical Benefit Scheme (CSMBS)</strong></th>
<th><strong>Social Health Scheme (SHS)</strong></th>
<th><strong>Universal Coverage Scheme (UCS)</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year of introduction</td>
<td>1960s</td>
<td>1990s</td>
<td>2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beneficiaries</td>
<td>Gov. employees &amp; dependents, retirees</td>
<td>Private sector employees</td>
<td>Rest of population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pop Coverage</td>
<td>5 million (8 %)</td>
<td>11 million (17 %)</td>
<td>49 million (75 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding</td>
<td>Govt. budget</td>
<td>Payroll contribution</td>
<td>Govt. budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Outpatient: fee for service</td>
<td>Tripartite</td>
<td>Outpatient: per capita</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inpatient: DRG</td>
<td>Outpatient: per capita</td>
<td>Inpatient: DRG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Inpatient: DRG</td>
<td>Global budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Healthcare Infrastructure

- **Regional Hospitals**: 33
- **Provincial Hospitals**: 83
- **District Hospitals**: 774
- **Primary Health Care Centers**: 12,495

Voluntary Health Workers

Service Providing: MOPH 80%, other Public 10%, Private 10%
Healthcare infrastructure

Primary Healthcare Center (sub-district)  Provincial hospital

District hospital

Healthcare infrastructure

Sriraj Hospital

Tropical Medicine Hospital

Ramathibodi Hospital  Chakri Naruebodindra Hospital
Other Healthcare Professional Trainings in Thailand

- Nurse
- Dentist
- Pharmacist
- Public health personnel
- Medical technologist
- Physical therapist
- Occupational therapist
- Prosthetist/orthotist
- Dietitian
- Speech therapist
- Hearing therapist

Distribution of Physicians in Thailand

North 1:3,279
Central 1:2,638
Northeast 1:5,308
Bangkok 1:850
South 1:3,545

- Total M.D’s 31,821
- MD per population 1 : 2,166
- public : private 78 : 22
- Target M.D. per population 1 : 1,500

9,339 more M.D’s needed
### Healthcare personal /10,000 population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Thailand</th>
<th>Singapore</th>
<th>Malaysia</th>
<th>Laos</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Medical doctor</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacist</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dentist</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Satisfaction in universal coverage

- **Patients' satisfaction in universal coverage**
- **Healthcare providers' satisfaction in job**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>50.99</td>
<td>56.57</td>
<td>60.75</td>
<td>60.27</td>
<td>78.57</td>
<td>66.86</td>
<td>68.48</td>
<td>66.61</td>
<td>64.42</td>
<td>66.21</td>
<td>67.91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Intern frequency of duty (per month)

- 34-73% of interns on duty >17 times/mo.

Intern work-hour (per week)

- 54-61% of interns worked >100 hr./wk.
### Working hour of MD by hospital beds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Duration of work (hour/week)</th>
<th>Number of beds</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of MD (n)</td>
<td>154 92 27 16 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of beds</td>
<td>Total 400 200 120 90 60 30 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working hour (hour/week)</td>
<td>94 84 122 128 68 77 77 122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regular work</td>
<td>59 68 30 61 68 51 45 58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On call</td>
<td>35 16 92 67 0 26 32 64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rest (hour/week)</td>
<td>74 84 46 40 100 91 91 46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total hours (per week)</td>
<td>168 168 168 168 168 168 168</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Time MD spent with patients in clinic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Duration (minute)</th>
<th>Number of patients (%)</th>
<th>Community hospital* (%)</th>
<th>Secondary/tertiary care hospital** (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>393 (29)</td>
<td>298 (18)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>364 (26)</td>
<td>451 (27)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>228 (16)</td>
<td>330 (20)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>109 (8)</td>
<td>193 (11)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>111 (8)</td>
<td>166 (10)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10</td>
<td>121 (9)</td>
<td>204 (12)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;10</td>
<td>62 (4)</td>
<td>45 (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mean</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.86 ± 6.74</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.59 ± 3.72</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Range</strong></td>
<td><strong>1 – 40</strong></td>
<td><strong>1 – 85</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 1,388 visits / 25 MD's
** 1,687 visits / 36 MD's

## Medical litigation
(2002-2015)

![Graph of Medical litigation (2002-2015)](chart)

- Civil cases
- Criminal cases

Legal office, Ministry of public Health
Causes of litigation

- Mismanagement: 116
- Child delivery: 56
- Negligence: 23
- Misdiagnosis: 22
- Drug reaction: 10
- Not up to standard: 6
- Inadequate devices: 2

n = 230

Legal office, Ministry of public Health

---

Healthcare Professional Hazard

In 2013 (n= 532)

- Death: 3
- Disability: 4
- TB contact: 191
- Physical attack: 173

Ministry of Public Health, 2013
Ministry of Public Health of Thailand (MOPH) Policy

- Prevention and health promotion excellence
- Service excellence
- People excellence
- Governance excellence

MOPH policy on people excellence

- Human resource strategy and organization
- Human resource management
- Human resource development
- Human resource network
20-year plan, 2016-2036

1. Cultivation of virtue: Promote core value which is applied throughout the ministry
   Draw up moral guideline

2. Strengthen human workforce potential in 4 areas
   Business acumen
   General management
   Leadership
   Professionalism

3. Roadmap for organization happiness
   Action plan for organization happiness
   Innovation of the new “Chief Officer Employee Experience Officer (CEEO)”
   to oversee activity happiness in the organization

4. Metric of happiness

---

Happidometer was used to assess happiness/ stress in 298,793 (78.84%)
of MOPH personnel (384,536) in 2017 (18 April - 30 June 2017
76.14% female, 23.16% male, and undetermined 0.43%,
average age 38.98 yr.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Point</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Healthy body</td>
<td>65.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Relaxation</td>
<td>55.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Altruism</td>
<td>68.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Spiritualism</td>
<td>70.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Happy family</td>
<td>65.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Good social</td>
<td>62.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Search for knowledge</td>
<td>62.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Good finance</td>
<td>50.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Happiness in work</td>
<td>61.52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Financial incentive for medical doctor

• Basic salary
• On duty fee
• Fee for medical/surgical procedures
• Professional fee
• Compensation for not committing private practice
• Compensation for remote area
• Compensation for dangerous area
• Fee for remaining in service in the rural area for more than 5, 10 and 20 yr

Announcement

The Thai Medical Council
Number 104/ 2017
Policy for workload of medical doctor in public sector

It has been apparent that medical doctor in public hospital has heavy burden of workload and insufficient rest resulting in negative impact on health and quality of life. Under the authority of article 21(1) of the Medical Practice Act (AD 1982), the meeting of Thai Medical Council on 24 September 2017 issued this announcement on policy on workload of medical doctor in public sector for administrator of public hospital to comply as follows:

For intern
1. 1 working hour outside an official working hour shall not exceed 40 hours/week
1.2 duration of duty in emergency department shall not exceed 16 hours uninterrupted

2. Medical doctor from the age of 55 years onward should be exempt from duty outside an office hour
   It is announced and should be complied.
   Announced on 12 October 2017
   Professor Prasit Wattanapa
   Chairman of the Thai Medical Council

Unofficial translation by Rajata Rajatanavin, MD
Thank you